

Schedule 3.8 – Retention and Incentive Programs Report

March 3, 2023

Review of Liberty's 2021 Regulatory Financial Statements/2023 Rate Application

1 Retention and Incentives Programs

- 2 Liberty's 2023 budget includes a \$1.5M amount for retention and incentives programs. The table below
- 3 provides the breakdown for the various programs, based on current market conditions. Liberty manages
- 4 these programs at an aggregate level and may allocate different amounts to different programs
- 5 throughout the year, as market conditions dictate.

Table 1 Budget per Program

Residential Incentives	150,000
Commercial Incentives	1,000,000
Propane Winback	300,000
Retention	50,000
Total	1,500,000

6

7 Liberty resumed its use of its regulated ratepayer funded retention and incentives programs in the last

- 8 quarter of 2021. Prior to this Liberty used the shareholder funded Fuel for the Future Fund ("FFF") to provide
- 9 incentives to customers. Table 2 outlines the FFF spending.

Table 2 Committed Spending per Year

	Oct - Dec 2019	Jan - Dec 2020	Jan - Sep 2021	D Total Committed Spending
Residential Incentives		70,123	56,055	126,178
Commercial Incentives		1,629,514	1,341,810	2,971,324
Propane Winback		284,739	624,800	909,539
Retention	87,356	219,388	28,400	335,144
Other Expenditures		527,567	164,788	692,355
Total	87,356	2,731,331	2,215,853	5,034,540

10 11

- 12 Table 3a includes the approved regulated amounts which Liberty spent on the various programs. The
- 13 tables below provide the details for each program, including spent amounts as of September 30, 2022.



Residential Incentive									
	I	Budget		TOTAL	Co	mmitted	۷	ariance	
2017	\$	100,000	\$	100,000	\$	88,250	\$	11,750	
2018	\$	100,000	\$	111,750	\$	136,500	\$	(24,750)	
2019	\$	250,000	\$	225,250	\$	152,950	\$	72,300	
2020	\$	-	\$	72,300	\$	72,300	\$	(0)	
2021	\$	-	\$	(0)	\$	41,072	\$	(41,072)	

Propane Winback									
Budget				TOTAL	Со	mmitted	v	ariance	
2017									
2018	\$	100,000	\$	100,000	\$	20,038	\$	79,962	
2019	\$	50,000	\$	129,962	\$	128,352	\$	1,610	
2020	\$	50,000	\$	51,610	\$	51,610	\$	0	
2021	\$	-	\$	0	\$	66,469	\$	(66,468)	

<u>Table 3a</u>
Spending per Program

Commercial Incentive								
		Budget		TOTAL	Со	mmitted	١	Variance
2017			\$	-			\$	-
2018	\$	250,000	\$	250,000	\$	31,000	\$	219,000
2019	\$	500,000	\$	719,000	\$	709,869	\$	9,131
2020	\$	100,000	\$	109,131	\$	109,131	\$	(0)
2021	\$	-	\$	(0)	\$	109,420	\$	(109,420)

Retention							
	E	Budget	TOTAL	Со	mmitted	٧	ariance/
2017	\$	100,000	\$ 100,000	\$	60,101	\$	39,899
2018	\$	100,000	\$ 139,899	\$	69,003	\$	70,896
2019	\$	50,000	\$ 120,896	\$	91,981	\$	28,915
2020	\$	-	\$ 28,915	\$	25,366	\$	3,549
2021	\$	-	\$ 3,549	\$	-	\$	3,549

<u>Table 3b</u>

Spending per Program

YTD Sept 2022

Program	Α	mount		
Residential Incentive	\$	70,240		
Commercial Incentive	\$	311,800		
Propane Winback	\$ 270,672			
Retention	\$	-		
Total	\$	652,712		

З

4 Liberty believes that it is in the best interest of the public system to keep ratepayers on the system. Liberty

5 requires retention and incentive programs to protect both the utility and the public system ratepayers

6 from the potential threat from unregulated fuels and electrification.

It is impossible to fully predict volatility in commodity markets. Items such as war or shifts in public policy can cause significant pricing swings. In 2014, Liberty lost approximately 500 customers due to a commodity spike that primarily affected the other natural gas marketers. The price spike only lasted about 4 months but caused immense damage to the remaining ratepayers and to the gas utilities' reputation, which stunted growth for several years until trust could slowly be regained. Retention programs allow Liberty to provide customers with peace of mind during short-term periods of price instability and provide the opportunity to factually show the customer the real annual fuel cost savings or deficit.



1 The Federal government is incenting all New Brunswickers to switch away from all forms of combustion-

- 2 burning appliances except for wood. Federal government grants from NB Power are being advertised to
- 3 switch natural gas appliances to electric or wood burning, even though the natural gas burning
- 4 appliance is better for the environment than burning wood and is often just as clean as electric. Most
- 5 Liberty customers use natural gas for heating in the winter months, at this time when NB Power often
- 6 uses fuel oil to run peaking power plants as they cannot provide clean energy in these months. Natural
- 7 gas is over 1000% cleaner than #2 oil and even more than heavier oils.

8 Mini-splits and electric baseboards are space heaters that do not promote true full building efficiency and 9 create a space that is very difficult to retrofit to take advantage of future improvements in technology. 10 Switching New Brunswickers to a central heating mindset will create sustainable environmental 11 improvement rather than blind switching to electric space heaters. Promotion of Central Heating systems 12 is required to ensure New Brunswickers are gaining true efficiency and can take advantage of future 13 improvements in technology. Liberty requires incentives to encourage customers to switch prior to 14 complete appliance failure. This is required for multiple reasons:

- Allows customers to start saving money sooner
- Allows us to reduce carbon emissions quicker
- 17 Quicker growth while maintaining a positive ROI
- Customers need help to afford to make the switch when they are ready to move forward
- 19 Most appliances fail in the winter
- 20 A failed appliance causes customer hardship
- 21 Liberty cannot run underground gas lines in the winter
- 22 Furthermore, beginning July 2023, not only will New Brunswickers be required to pay an additional \$15 per
- 23 tonne for carbon-emitting products ("Carbon Tax"), but the province will no longer be rebating these
- 24 charges at the point of sale. Instead, rebate cheques will be provided quarterly by the Federal
- 25 government. Customers will be facing these increased charges and may look to alternatives to compare
- 26 costs. However, the incorporation and presentation of the Carbon Tax on customer bills is not consistent
- 27 across fuel types. For example, this charge is shown as a separate charge for natural gas customers.
- However, this is not the case for electricity customers. Liberty needs the ability to promote and provide
- 29 these retention and incentive programs in order to educate customers on their fuel costs and options, all
- 30 of which benefits the customer, the utility and the public system.

31 Retention Program

Liberty is again requesting retention program dollars so that it may continue to protect its customer base from additional erosion due to competitive threats. This is available to qualifying MGS, LGS and CGS



1 customers. Each potential customer is evaluated individually based on variables and qualifying conditions

- 2 which include:
- Customers must prove that they have been offered a competitive program, in writing;
- Customers must sign a contract with Liberty for a specified term;
- Customers must continue to use natural gas for a specified term, or they must return all funds to
 Liberty.

Liberty will evaluate the level of incentive based on the difference of availing natural gas costs compared
to using the offered, alternative fuel.

- 9 MGS customers sign a contract to remain on the system for a minimum of two years. LGS and CGS
- 10 customers sign a contract to remain on the system for a minimum of one year.
- 11 . The following is a breakdown of the reasons Liberty has lost customers, by rate class, since 2017.

Lost Customer per Rate Class									
	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021	YTD Sept 2022			
SGS	(68)	(71)	(64)	(60)	(75)	(75)			
MGS	(90)	(64)	(56)	(69)	(43)	(46)			
LGS	(8)	(1)	(4)	(2)	(3)	(3)			
CGS	(1)	0	(1)	(1)	(1)	0			
ICGS	0	0	0	0	0	0			
OPS	0	0	0	0	0	0			
Total	(167)	(136)	(125)	(132)	(122)	(124)			
MGS-S	(60)	(37)	(34)	(43)	(29)	(36)			
M/GS-L	(30)	(27)	(22)	(26)	(14)	(10)			
Total MGS	(90)	(64)	(56)	(69)	(43)	(46)			
LGS-S	(8)	(1)	(2)	(1)	(3)	(1)			
LGS-L	0	0	(2)	(1)	0	(2)			
Total LGS	(8)	(1)	(4)	(2)	(3)	(3)			

Table 4 Lost Customer per Rate Class

	•					
	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021	YTD Sept 2022
Redlock	(18)	(22)	(8)	(4)	(7)	(15)
Seasonal Lock	(9)	(14)	(22)	(21)	(24)	(40)
Temp Lock for Renos	(13)	(21)	(10)	(24)	(27)	(33)
Lost Customer - Business closure/Bldg de:	(49)	(32)	(34)	(21)	(12)	(18)
Converted to propane	(51)	(29)	(26)	(33)	(13)	(1)
Converted to oil	0	(1)	(2)	(2)	(1)	0
Converted to electricity	(26)	(17)	(22)	(26)	(37)	(17)
Converted to unknown fuels	(1)	0	(1)	(1)	(1)	0
Total	(167)	(136)	(125)	(132)	(122)	(124)
Converted to propane	(51)	(29)	(26)	(33)	(13)	(1)
SGS	(9)	(5)	(7)	(9)	(7)	0
MGS-S	(19)	(11)	(7)	(13)	(4)	0
MGS-L	(20)	(13)	(10)	(11)	(1)	(1)
LGS-S	(3)	0	(1)	0	(1)	0
LGS-L	0	0	0	0	0	0
CGS	0	0	(1)	0	0	0

Table 5 Lost Customer per Classification

1

 Table 6

 2017 Lost Customer per Classification

	SGS	MGS	LGS	CGS	ICGS	OPS	Total
Redlock	(13)	(5)	0	0	0	0	(18)
Seasonal Lock	(8)	(1)	0	0	0	0	(9)
Temp Lock for Renos	(6)	(7)	0	0	0	0	(13)
Lost Customer - Business closure/Bldg destroyed/meters combined	(20)	(24)	(5)	0	0	0	(49)
Converted to propane	(9)	(39)	(3)	0	0	0	(51)
Converted to oil	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Converted to electricity	(12)	(13)	0	(1)	0	0	(26)
Converted to unknown fuels	0	(1)	0	0	0	0	(1)
Total	(68)	(90)	(8)	(1)	0	0	(167)

Table7

2018 Lost Customer per Classification

	SGS	MGS	LGS	CGS	ICGS	OPS	Total
Redlock	(15)	(7)	0	0	0	0	(22)
Seasonal Lock	(10)	(4)	0	0	0	0	(14)
Temp Lock for Renos	(16)	(4)	(1)	0	0	0	(21)
Lost Customer - Business closure/Bldg destroyed/meters combined	(13)	(19)	0	0	0	0	(32)
Converted to propane	(5)	(24)	0	0	0	0	(29)
Converted to oil	0	(1)	0	0	0	0	(1)
Converted to electricity	(12)	(5)	0	0	0	0	(17)
Converted to unknown fuels	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total	(71)	(64)	(1)	0	0	0	(136)



 Table 8

 2019 Lost Customer per Classification

	SGS	MGS	LGS	CGS	ICGS	OPS	Total
Redlock	(6)	(2)	0	0	0	0	(8)
Seasonal Lock	(20)	(2)	0	0	0	0	(22)
Temp Lock for Renos	(5)	(4)	(1)	0	0	0	(10)
Lost Customer - Business closure/Bldg destroyed/meters combined	(10)	(22)	(2)	0	0	0	(34)
Converted to propane	(7)	(17)	(1)	(1)	0	0	(26)
Converted to oil	0	(2)	0	0	0	0	(2)
Converted to electricity	(15)	(7)	0	0	0	0	(22)
Converted to unknown fuels	(1)	0	0	0	0	0	(1)
Total	(64)	(56)	(4)	(1)	0	0	(125)

Table 9

2020 Lost Customer per Classification

	SGS	MGS	LGS	CGS	ICGS	OPS	Total
Redlock	(2)	(2)	0	0	0	0	(4)
Seasonal Lock	(10)	(11)	0	0	0	0	(21)
Temp Lock for Renos	(11)	(12)	(1)	0	0	0	(24)
Lost Customer - Business closure/Bldg destroyed/meters combined	(10)	(9)	(1)	(1)	0	0	(21)
Converted to propane	(9)	(24)	0	0	0	0	(33)
Converted to oil	0	(2)	0	0	0	0	(2)
Converted to electricity	(17)	(9)	0	0	0	0	(26)
Converted to unknown fuels	(1)	0	0	0	0	0	(1)
Total	(60)	(69)	(2)	(1)	0	0	(132)

Table 10 2021 Lost Customer per Classification

	SGS	MGS	LGS	CGS	ICGS	OPS	Total
Redlock	(6)	(1)	0	0	0	0	(7)
Seasonal Lock	(16)	(7)	(1)	0	0	0	(24)
Temp Lock for Renos	(9)	(16)	(1)	(1)	0	0	(27)
Lost Customer - Business closure/Bldg destroyed/meters combined	(6)	(6)	0	0	0	0	(12)
Converted to propane	(13)	0	0	0	0	0	(13)
Converted to oil	(1)	0	0	0	0	0	(1)
Converted to electricity	(29)	(8)	0	0	0	0	(37)
Converted to unknown fuels	(1)	0	0	0	0	0	(1)
Total	(81)	(38)	(2)	(1)	0	0	(122)

2

1

Table 11

YTD Sept 2022 Lost Customer per Classification

	SGS	MIGS	LGS	CGS	ICGS	OPS	Total
Redlock	(7)	(6)	(2)	0	0	0	(15)
Seasonal Lock	(24)	(15)	(1)	0	0	0	(40)
Temp Lock for Renos	(23)	(10)	0	0	0	0	(33)
Lost Customer - Business closure/Bldg destroyed/meters combined	(8)	(10)	0	0	0	0	(18)
Converted to propane	(1)	0	0	0	0	0	(1)
Converted to oil	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Converted to electricity	(12)	(5)	0	0	0	0	(17)
Converted to unknown fuels	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total	(75)	(46)	(3)	0	0	0	(124)

3

4



Incentives Program

Liberty is requesting incentive program funds to stimulate existing infill opportunities and attract newcustomers. Below are the program guidelines:

- 4 New residential natural gas customers qualify for an incentive of \$2,000, which may be adjusted upwards
- 5 or downwards during the year, depending on the equipment being selected for installation. Qualification
- 6 requirements include:
- 7 New natural gas residential customers only
- 8 Property must currently have access to a natural gas pipeline
- 9 New home construction or existing home retrofit
- 10 New and existing commercial natural gas customers will qualify for incentives based on the net revenue
- 11 that will be generated over a certain term. Qualification requirements include:
- New or existing natural gas commercial customers only
- 13 Property must currently have access to a natural gas pipeline
- New construction or existing retrofit
- 15 Customers will sign a form confirming details and provide receipts. Amounts are not payable until after all
- 16 appliances are inspected and turned on.

17 Propane Winback Program

- The Propane Winback program is used to recapture lost customers who left the system for a propanealternative.
- 20 It is available to qualifying customers who left the system for a propane alternative. Each potential
- 21 customer is evaluated individually based on the cost of previous annual consumption as compared to
- 22 prevailing market propane prices. The table below provides an example of the analysis that will be used
- 23 to determine eligibility.



Calculation Procedure								
Line Item	Calculation	Example	Unit					
1 Last 12-month NG consumption	History	528	GJ					
2 Last 12-month NG distribution cost	Calculated using current rates and Line 1	6,273	\$					
3 LUG Commodity	History	8.95	\$/GJ					
4 Alternative commodity	Provided by Sales, if available from customer	10	\$/GJ					
5 Which commodity is cheaper?	LUG or Alternative	LUG						
6 Last 12 months commodity cost	Line 1 x Line 3 or Line 5	4,726	\$					
7 Last 12 months total NG cost	Line 2 + Line 6	10,999	#					
8 Propane price	Provided by Sales	0.4	\$/L					
9 Last 12 months propane cost	Line 1 x Line 8 x 39.51	8,345	\$					
10 Does propane provide savings?	Yes or No	Yes						
11 Savings Amount	If yes, Line 7 – Line 9	2,654	\$					
12 Incentive offer calculated	Equal Line 11 if propane provides saving	2,654	\$					
13 Payback Year	Line 16 / Line 2	0.4	Year					
14 Does this customer payback in less than 1 year	Line 13 less than 1 year?	Yes						
15 Incentive offered?		Yes						
16 Incentive offer to customer	Sales to have discussion with customer	2,700	\$					

Table 12 Calculation Procedure

1

2 Customers will sign a form confirming details and provide receipts. Amounts are not payable until after

3 all appliances are inspected and turned on.

4 Liberty will provide a report to the Board quarterly, together with Liberty's quarterly financial statements,

5 consistent with previous years' submissions.

